# Ethics Panel Debates a Market in Human Organs

BY TODD ZWILLICH Contributing Writer

WASHINGTON — A report from the Institute of Medicine has helped fuel debate on what can be done to stem the nation's increasing shortage of donated organs.

The report, written by a panel of respected experts, recommended intensified efforts to boost Americans' flagging altruistic instincts and called for more research into how to improve the existing organ donation system.

Institute of Medicine advisers also called for revised resuscitation standards to increase the chances that organs of brain-dead trauma victims could be preserved for transplant. They also encouraged authorities to experiment with a new cardiac standard of death, in the hopes that it could roughly double the number of available grafts culled from patients who become donors after being declared brain-dead.

Such a standard could allow up to 22,000 donations per year from patients in permanent vegetative states or comas, said James F. Childress, Ph.D., a professor of medical ethics at the University of Virginia and chair of the Institute of Medicine

But for some ethicists, the report was more noteworthy for what it did not recommend. The Institute of Medicine panel avoided a host of more controversial policies that some ethicists say are needed in light of the thousands of Americans who die each year on transplant waiting lists.

"This report could be said in many ways [to be] a conservative report," Dr. Childress told members of the President's Council on Bioethics at a recent council meeting.

The Institute of Medicine panel recommended against what some members of the President's Council support: allowing the buying and selling of human organs from live donors, in the hopes that market forces move supply nearer to demand.

Some ethicists acknowledge that allowing an organ market is a radical solution, fraught with the ethical pitfalls inherent in commodifying body parts. But they see the benefit as outweighing the risk of death for the 92,400 Americans currently on the United Network for Organ Sharing waiting list. Meanwhile, the number of Americans with end-stage renal disease is expected to double to nearly 650,000 by 2015.

A vocal group of free-market advocates sees it differently. Dr. Benjamin Hippen, a nephrologist at Carolinas Medical Center in Charlotte, N.C., argues that a regulated market in human organs would boost the supply of viable kidneys, while doing away with a dangerous international black

Dr. Hippen, an at-large member of the United Network for Organ Sharing board, rejects the idea that a legal organ market is a necessary evil.

"Mine is not an argument that the ends justify the means, mine is an argument that the means themselves do not warrant legal prohibition," he told the bioethics council.

Meanwhile, others continue to caution that financial incentives would exploit low-income individuals desperate to sell organs out of economic need.

We simply can't ignore the fact that the sellers are going to be the poor, predominantly. Most well-off people are not going to sell their organs as a way to buy a third car," said Eric Cohen of the Ethics and Public Policy Center, a conservative think tank in Washington.

The President's Council on Bioethics is expected to issue its recommendations for organ donation in the fall.

# CLASSIFIEDS

#### PROFESSIONAL OPPORTUNITIES

## **Outstanding Internal Medicine Opportunity**

in Beautiful and Charming Southern community. Thriving private practice. Only regional medical Center in the area. Excellent financial package, lucrative salary and bonuses. Student Loan Repayment. One of the best Malpractice Climates in the U.S. Waterfront property, Top 18 hole Golf Course. Recreational Haven - boating, water-skiing, fishing, hiking, biking, nearby beaches. Quaint, historic community. Excellent educational opportunities. Private schools and local university. Great weather for year-round activities.

Contact: Brian White at 1-888-339-7444; fax cv to 1-940-234-5315; email cv to brian@crossroadshealth.net

#### COLORADO, Greeley

Seeking Board Certified Internal Medicine for Hospitalist opportunity, Providers enjoy flexible scheduling with ample time off between shift perfect for outdoor enthusiast. Position could become a teaching opportunity. North Colorado Medical Center (NCMC) is a fully accredited, private, not-for-profit facility licensed to operate 326 beds. It serves as a regional medical center with community-based and specialty services in a service area including southern Wyoming, western Colorado; the foothills of the Rocky Mountains are only around 30-40 miles to the west and close to several other communities in the area; Fort Collins 29 miles, Denver, Boulder and Cheyenne, WY are only 50 miles. For more information, contact Recruiter Ruby Mangum at Sterling Healthcare, 800-476-4587 x4226 or Ruby.Mangum@sterlinghealthcare.com.

Mercy Memorial Health Center in Ardmore, OK has positions available for the following: Hospitalist. M.D. in Medicine and three years Residency in Internal Medicine required (or U.S. equivalent). Must have or be eligible for Oklahoma State Medical Licensure. Medical Technologist. Bachelor's in Medical Technology or U.S. equivalent, EOE. Mail resume to Jeremy Jones, 1011 14th Ave. NW, Ardmore, OK 73401. Do not apply

#### Disclaimer

INTERNAL MEDICINE News assumes the statements made in classified advertisements are accurate, but cannot investigate the statements and assumes no responsibility or liability concerning their content. The Publisher reserves the right to decline. withdraw, or edit advertisements. Every effort will be made to avoid mistakes, but responsibility cannot be accepted for clerical or printer errors.

#### MEDICAL BILLING

### **Claim Rite Medical Billing Service**

A medical billing service with over 18 years of experience handling medical claims. Dedicated to efficient, thorough and accurate claims processing. Implementation of all aspects of billing including electronic billing to insurance companies as well as self-pay for collections. All necessary follow-up done to insure that you receive full and fair reimbursement in a timely fashion. We offer highly reasonable rates for our services.

1-732-869-1740

#### FOR CLASSIFIED RATES AND INFORMATION:

Robin Cryan Elsevier-Internal Medicine News 360 Park Avenue South New York, NY 10010 (800) 379-8785, (212) 633-3160 FAX: (212) 633-3820 Email ad to: r.cryan@elsevier.com

#### **ATTORNEYS**



The USIDNET, A NIH-sponsored national consortium to promote the study of primary immunodeficiency, has established several new exciting programs for young physicians interested in research and management of primary immunodeficiency diseases.

- · Short Term Training
- Traveling Scholarships
- Summer School
- Laboratory Training Experience

All programs are targeted toward young physicians interested in research and management of primary immunodeficiency. Senior medical students and recent medical graduates in residencies or research fellowships are also invited to apply. All programs provide paid stipends

Visit the US Immunodeficiency Network website at <a href="www.usidnet.org">www.usidnet.org</a> for more information or call Tamara Brown at (800) 296-4433 Ext 211.

